Employer Survey Analysis: Standard 4.3

Administration and Purpose:

Acquisition of data from current employers provides valuable information not otherwise accounted for by the data currently available for CAEP standard 4.3: Satisfaction of Employers. Therefore, a study was designed using a survey to investigate the degree to which employers are satisfied with BCOE teacher preparation for assigned responsibilities in working with P-12 students. Questions on the Employer Survey focused on using appropriate instruction, content knowledge, pedagogical skills, using data to drive decisions, and professional dispositions.

These questions were modified from the Ohio Department of Higher Education (ODHE) Educator Preparation Performance Report Pre-Service Teacher Survey Questions and the BCOE Post Employment Survey Questions. These questions were modified to measure supervisor ratings. For example, instead of the statement “I use evaluation results for evidence-based decision-making”, the Employer Survey included the statement, “The teacher uses evaluation results for evidence-based decision-making.” All information included in the Employer Survey will allow the BCOE to know if employers are satisfied with the preparation of their BCOE-prepared teachers for the responsibilities in working with P-12.

Validity:

Content validity was established by following the existing questions from ODHE and the BCOE and by disseminating the survey to a group of 14 principals in districts other than our target districts and asking for feedback on the content of the survey questions. Minor adjustments were made based on feedback given.

The target population for this study includes employers of recent graduates from the BCOE defined as teachers who have been employed in their field of study within two years of graduation. Participants for this study are principals who have employed a recent graduate of the BCOE. Participants were recruited from area-wide principal meetings as well as through word of mouth. Participants were given the option to complete the Employer Survey either online through Survey Monkey or through a paper copy that was mailed back to BCOE.

Content of the Survey:

The Employer Survey consists of 32 questions broken into 11 categories: Content, Assessment, Communication, Collaboration, Technology, Ethics, Professionalism, Standards and Policies, Instruction, Student Characteristics, and Classroom Environment. The survey also contained four multiple choice demographic questions.

Survey Participants:

A total of 40 employers completed an informed consent statement included at the beginning of the survey and responded to the questions. Thirteen employers completed paper versions of the survey, and 27 completed the electronic survey on Survey Monkey. Of the 40 employers, 19 employed a graduate of the Early Childhood program, 20 employed a graduate of the Middle
Childhood program, 13 employed a graduate of the Adolescent and Young Adult program, 9 employed a graduate of the Special Education program, and 5 employed a graduate of the Multi-age program. These numbers add up to more than 40 as some employers had graduates of more than one program. Nine employers (22.5%) were from urban schools, 19 employers (47.5%) from suburban schools, and 12 employers (30%) from rural schools. Employers were also asked the number of early career graduates they had employed. 15 employers (37.5%) had one new graduate employed, 10 employers (25%) had 2 new graduates employed, 5 employers (12.5%) had 3 new graduates employed, 5 employers (12.5%) had 4 new graduates employed, 5 employers (12.5%) had 5 new graduates employed, and 1 employer (2.5%) had 8 new graduates employed.

Scoring:
Scores on the Likert-type questions were given numerical ratings from 1 (Highly Disagree) to 5 (Highly Agree). The scores for the questions in each category were averaged by participant. Each category consisted of two to four questions. Results for each category on the Employer Survey were averaged by BCOE program. Table 1 displays the means and standard deviations of each category by BCOE program. A copy of the BCOE Employer Survey is located in Appendix A.

Analysis of Data:
The mean scores in each category were all above 3.5, with all total mean scores above 3.9. In the Early Childhood program, graduates were rated highest in the area of Ethics (M=4.37, SD=.54) and lowest in the area of Assessment (M=3.79, SD=.70). In the Middle Childhood program, graduates were rated highest in the area of Ethics (M=4.65, SD=.46) and lowest in the area of Assessment (M=4.02, SD=.72). In the Adolescent and Young Adult program, graduates were rated highest in Ethics (M=4.42, SD=.70) and lowest in the area of Assessment (M=3.82, SD=.78). In the Special Education program, graduates were rated highest in the area of Ethics (M=4.39, SD=.60) and lowest in the area of Assessment (M=3.59, SD=.83). In the Multi-age program, graduates were rated highest in the area of Content (M=4.47, SD=.51) and lowest in the area of Assessment (M=3.87, SD=.77).

These results indicate that overall, the area with which employers were the most satisfied was Ethics (M=4.45, SD=.60). Employers agree that BCOE graduates follow professional ethics, policies, and legal codes of professional conduct and apply ethical and legal practices when performing professional responsibilities. The area with which employers were the least satisfied was Assessment (M=3.98, SD=.77), although this mean was very close to the ‘Agree’ range. Employers indicated BCOE graduates may have more difficulty using assessment data to inform instruction, using a variety of diagnostic, formative, and summative assessments, and using evaluation results for evidence-based decision making.

The survey results provide insight into the YSU Educator Preparation programs and the ways in which employers of graduates in their first and second year of employment feel the program has equipped the graduates for the profession. Results of the study increased knowledge of employer satisfaction with BCOE graduates, particularly the graduates’ level of professionalism, content knowledge, instructional practices, use of assessment data, ability to communicate effectively,
and ability to collaborate with peers. Through using these results, the BCOE can continue to excel in areas in which graduates are thriving and work to improve the areas that employers view as less successful.

Table 1. Means and standard deviations of scores in each category by program

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>N</th>
<th>Content</th>
<th>Assessment</th>
<th>Communication</th>
<th>Collaboration</th>
<th>Technology</th>
<th>Ethics</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Early Childhood</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>4.21 (.54)</td>
<td>3.79 (.70)</td>
<td>4.05 (.59)</td>
<td>3.97 (.68)</td>
<td>4.11 (.68)</td>
<td>4.37 (.57)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Middle Childhood</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>4.23 (.56)</td>
<td>4.02 (.72)</td>
<td>4.26 (.73)</td>
<td>4.23 (.68)</td>
<td>4.33 (.71)</td>
<td>4.65 (.46)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Adolescent and Young</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>4.05 (.56)</td>
<td>3.82 (.78)</td>
<td>3.96 (.68)</td>
<td>4.04 (.69)</td>
<td>4.27 (.67)</td>
<td>4.42 (.70)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Special Education</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>4.04 (.56)</td>
<td>3.59 (.83)</td>
<td>3.94 (.97)</td>
<td>4.00 (.79)</td>
<td>4.22 (.62)</td>
<td>4.39 (.60)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Multi-Age</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4.47 (.51)</td>
<td>3.87 (.77)</td>
<td>4.05 (.48)</td>
<td>4.20 (.57)</td>
<td>4.10 (.55)</td>
<td>4.30 (.45)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>4.25 (.56)</td>
<td>3.98 (.77)</td>
<td>4.18 (.65)</td>
<td>4.14 (.67)</td>
<td>4.23 (.67)</td>
<td>4.45 (.60)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>N</th>
<th>Professionalism</th>
<th>Standards</th>
<th>Instruction</th>
<th>Student Characteristics</th>
<th>Classroom Environment</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Early Childhood</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>4.16 (.67)</td>
<td>3.92 (.65)</td>
<td>4.05 (.54)</td>
<td>3.96 (.64)</td>
<td>4.13 (.59)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Middle Childhood</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>4.40 (.65)</td>
<td>4.10 (.66)</td>
<td>4.21 (.54)</td>
<td>4.08 (.72)</td>
<td>4.30 (.54)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Adolescent and Young</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>4.26 (.61)</td>
<td>4.00 (.89)</td>
<td>4.02 (.69)</td>
<td>3.90 (.76)</td>
<td>3.94 (.73)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Special Education</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>3.85 (.55)</td>
<td>3.72 (.91)</td>
<td>3.86 (.77)</td>
<td>3.85 (.87)</td>
<td>4.03 (.75)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Multi-Age</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4.00 (.62)</td>
<td>4.30 (.67)</td>
<td>4.35 (.60)</td>
<td>4.13 (.77)</td>
<td>4.25 (.59)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>4.31 (.63)</td>
<td>4.06 (.73)</td>
<td>4.17 (.62)</td>
<td>4.07 (.68)</td>
<td>4.21 (.66)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Appendix A

BCOE Employer Survey

Dear Potential Participant:

We are conducting a study to better understand the preparation that the Beeghly College of Education at Youngstown State University has provided for successful employment in a school district. In this study, you will be asked to complete a survey with 5 answer choices ranging from highly disagree to highly agree. This survey should take no more than 10 minutes of your time. There are no foreseeable risks to you for participating in this study.

All information will be handled in a strictly confidential manner, so that no one will be able to identify you when the results are reported. Your participation in this study is completely voluntary, and you may withdraw at any time without negative consequences. If you wish to withdraw during the study, simply notify one of the investigators using the contact information provided below.

Please feel free to contact Drs. Kathleen Aspiranti at (330) 941-3263 or kaspiranti@ysu.edu or Jane Beese at (330) 941-2236 or jbeese@ysu.edu, if you have any questions about the study. Or, for other questions, please contact the Office of Research Services at Youngstown State University at (330) 941-2377.

The electronic version of this survey can be found at:

https://www.surveymonkey.com/r/WL6D3MW

If completing the paper version of this survey, please return to:

Kathleen Aspiranti
One University Plaza
Youngstown State University
Youngstown, OH 44555

_______________________________________________________________________

By continuing on to the study, I understand the study described above. I am 18 years of age or older, and I agree to participate.
**Demographic Information:**

1. **Program affiliation of recent graduates working in your building (circle as many as apply):**
   - Early Childhood (Grades PreK-3)
   - Middle Childhood (Grades 4-9)
   - Adolescents to Young Adult (Grades 7-12)
   - Special Education
   - Multi-Age (Physical Education, Art, etc)

2. **Level of school building (circle as many as apply):**
   - Pre-School
   - Elementary School
   - Middle School
   - High School
   - Other: __________________

3. **Is your school:**
   - Urban
   - Suburban
   - Rural

4. **Number of Youngstown State University Beeghly College of Education graduates (within 2 years of graduation):**
   - 1
   - 2
   - 3
   - 4
   - 5
   - 6 or more

Please reflect on any new employees (within two years of graduation) that you may have working in your school who graduated from the Youngstown State University Beeghly College of Education. Then answer the following questions based on your beliefs of the competency of these recent graduates. Please circle the statement that most closely matches your beliefs.

**Content:**

1. **The teacher is competent in the content area in which s/he teaches.**
   - Highly disagree
   - Disagree
   - Neither agree or disagree
   - Agree
   - Highly agree

2. **The teacher is competent in the procedures, techniques, and methods of his/her content area.**
   - Highly disagree
   - Disagree
   - Neither agree or disagree
   - Agree
   - Highly agree
3. The teacher uses research and theory to inform his/her pedagogy.

Highly disagree    Disagree    Neither agree or disagree    Agree    Highly agree

Assessment:

1. The teacher uses assessment data to inform instruction.

Highly disagree    Disagree    Neither agree or disagree    Agree    Highly agree

2. The teacher uses a variety of diagnostic, formative, and summative assessments.

Highly disagree    Disagree    Neither agree or disagree    Agree    Highly agree

3. The teacher uses evaluation results for evidence-based decision-making.

Highly disagree    Disagree    Neither agree or disagree    Agree    Highly agree

Communication:

1. The teacher communicates high expectations to all students.

Highly disagree    Disagree    Neither agree or disagree    Agree    Highly agree

2. The teacher clearly communicates learning goals to students.

Highly disagree    Disagree    Neither agree or disagree    Agree    Highly agree

3. The teacher communicates clearly and effectively.

Highly disagree    Disagree    Neither agree or disagree    Agree    Highly agree

Collaboration:

1. The teacher communicates effectively with families and caregivers.

Highly disagree    Disagree    Neither agree or disagree    Agree    Highly agree

2. The teacher collaborates with colleagues and members of the community.

Highly disagree    Disagree    Neither agree or disagree    Agree    Highly agree
3. The teacher collaborates with colleagues, families, and communities to ensure that all students reach their potential.

   Highly disagree  Disagree  Neither agree or disagree  Agree  Highly agree

**Technology:**

1. The teacher uses technology to improve teaching and increase student learning.

   Highly disagree  Disagree  Neither agree or disagree  Agree  Highly agree

2. The teacher effectively and appropriately integrates various technologies into the classroom.

   Highly disagree  Disagree  Neither agree or disagree  Agree  Highly agree

**Ethics:**

1. The teacher follows professional ethics, policies, and legal codes of professional conduct.

   Highly disagree  Disagree  Neither agree or disagree  Agree  Highly agree

2. The teacher applies the professional code of conduct to his/her professional content area.

   Highly disagree  Disagree  Neither agree or disagree  Agree  Highly agree

3. The teacher applies ethical and legal practices when performing his/her professional responsibilities.

   Highly disagree  Disagree  Neither agree or disagree  Agree  Highly agree

**Professionalism:**

1. The teacher demonstrates professional, collaborative, and inclusive dispositions within the school setting.

   Highly disagree  Disagree  Neither agree or disagree  Agree  Highly agree

2. The teacher uses reflective professional judgment.

   Highly disagree  Disagree  Neither agree or disagree  Agree  Highly agree
3. The teacher engages in professional activities to expand his/her knowledge, experiences, and relationships.

| Highly disagree | Disagree | Neither agree or disagree | Agree | Highly agree |

**Standards and Policies**

1. The teacher demonstrates knowledge of education policies at the local, state, and national levels for instructional decision-making.

| Highly disagree | Disagree | Neither agree or disagree | Agree | Highly agree |

2. The teacher aligns instructional goals and activities with Ohio’s academic content standards, including the Common Core State Standards.

| Highly disagree | Disagree | Neither agree or disagree | Agree | Highly agree |

**Instruction:**

1. The teacher is able to use instructional strategies appropriate to his/her content area.

| Highly disagree | Disagree | Neither agree or disagree | Agree | Highly agree |

2. The teacher applies knowledge of how students learn to inform instruction.

| Highly disagree | Disagree | Neither agree or disagree | Agree | Highly agree |

3. The teacher differentiates instruction to support the learning needs of all students.

| Highly disagree | Disagree | Neither agree or disagree | Agree | Highly agree |

4. The teacher designs learning situations in which students work independently, collaboratively, and/or as a whole class.

| Highly disagree | Disagree | Neither agree or disagree | Agree | Highly agree |

**Student Characteristics**

1. The teacher is able to recognize characteristics of gifted students, students with disabilities, and at-risk students in order to plan and deliver appropriate instruction.

| Highly disagree | Disagree | Neither agree or disagree | Agree | Highly agree |
2. The teacher is able to meet the needs of students from diverse cultures, language skills, and experiences.

   | Highly disagree | Disagree | Neither agree or disagree | Agree | Highly agree |

3. The teacher is able to meet the educational needs of all students in a caring, non-discriminatory, equitable manner.

   | Highly disagree | Disagree | Neither agree or disagree | Agree | Highly agree |

**Classroom Environment:**

1. The teacher is able to use strategies to increase student motivation.

   | Highly disagree | Disagree | Neither agree or disagree | Agree | Highly agree |

2. The teacher uses strategies for effective classroom management.

   | Highly disagree | Disagree | Neither agree or disagree | Agree | Highly agree |

3. The teacher treats all students fairly and establishes an environment that is respectful, supportive, and caring.

   | Highly disagree | Disagree | Neither agree or disagree | Agree | Highly agree |

4. The teacher fosters an inclusive environment and respects the background of and beliefs held by his/her students.

   | Highly disagree | Disagree | Neither agree or disagree | Agree | Highly agree |