



John R. Kasich, Governor
John Carey, Chancellor

2016 Efficiency Reporting Guidance

In the early part of 2015, Gov. John R. Kasich created the Ohio Task Force on Affordability and Efficiency to make recommendations to Ohio's institutions of higher education based on three simultaneous principles 1) to be more efficient both in expense management and revenue generation 2) while offering an education of equal or higher quality and 3) decreasing costs to students and their families. The Task Force met several times during the course of 2015. In October the Task Force issued a report with ten recommendations to advise institutions on efficiency and academic practices which will improve both the quality of education and lower costs for students.

Furthermore, House Bill 64 (Section 369.550) requires each institution's board of trustees to complete an efficiency review, based on the Task Force's recommendations, by July 1, 2016, and submit their findings and implementation plans to the chancellor within 30 days, or by August 1, 2016. For additional information on each category and recommendation, please review the [Action Steps to Reduce College Costs report](#), issued by the Ohio Task Force on Affordability and Efficiency.

This document is intended to provide guidance for institutions' reports to the chancellor, based on the legislation – please modify and add additional detail as necessary. **The institutional efficiency review and the implementation plans captured by this template will serve as the data for 2016 Efficiency Advisory Committee Report. These reports are due August 1, 2016.** In 2017 and moving forward, ODHE will issue a survey to the institutions, based on the Task Force Report, as a status update to the implementation plans and will serve as the Efficiency Advisory Committee report.

Campuses will want to review the template to familiarize themselves with the format and content before beginning. The template is structured into four sections:

- **Section 1: Efficiencies** – The first section captures practices likely to yield significant savings for institutions that can then be passed on to students. This includes Procurement, Administrative and Operational, and Energy.
- **Section 2: Academic Practices** – This section covers areas such as textbooks, time to degree incentives, and academic course and program reviews. While improvements to academic processes and policies may not convey immediate cost savings, there will likely be tangible benefits that improve the quality of education for students.
- **Section 3: Policy Reforms** – This section captures additional policy reforms recommended by the Task Force.
- **Section 4: Cost Savings, Redeployment of Savings & Tangible Benefits to Students** – The last section will ask institutions to provide, if applicable, cost savings to the institution in actual dollars saved for each of the recommendations. Furthermore, the institution must advise if the institutional savings has been redeployed as a cost savings to students or offered a benefit to the quality of education for students.

Any questions can be directed to Sara Molski, Assistant Policy Director at the Ohio Department of Higher Education, at 614-728-8335 or by email at smolski@highered.ohio.gov.

Section I: Efficiency Practices

Procurement

Recommendation 3A | Campus contracts: Each institution must require that its employees use existing contracts for purchasing goods and services, starting with the areas with the largest opportunities for savings.

Has the institution implemented this recommendation? If yes, please provide an overview of the process used and the key outcomes.

YSU's Procurement Services office encourages campus financial managers to use existing contracts that have been negotiated by the State of Ohio Department of Administrative Services, locally by YSU, and/or by the Inter-University Council of Ohio Purchasing Group (IUC-PG) consortium. While the use of these contracts has resulted in cost-savings and efficiencies, not all goods or services are available through existing contracts; and better pricing is sometimes available through non-contracted vendors.

If the institution has not implemented this recommendation, is there a plan to implement? If yes, what is the implementation plan? If the institution has not implemented this recommendation and does not plan to do so, please provide the rationale. YSU will continue to participate in the IUC-PG to identify opportunities for shared contracts. Additionally, YSU will evaluate the merits of an institutional policy that would mandate the use of IUC-PG price agreements.

Recommendation 3B | Collaborative contracts: Ohio's colleges and universities must pursue new and/or strengthened joint purchasing agreements in the following categories:

- Copier/printer services
- Computer hardware
- Travel services
- Outbound shipping
- Scientific Supplies and Equipment
- Office Supplies and Equipment

Contract Type	Is the institution participating in joint contracts? [yes, no, plan to]	Include additional explanation here if needed. If the institution chooses not to participate, please explain why.
Copier / printer services	Plan to	YSU's existing print services vendor, ComDoc, has multiple agreements with other IUC institutions, including Ohio State University, BGSU, and the University of Akron. YSU is working with the IUC-PG to determine if opportunities exist to standardize these individual campus contracts into a single, state-wide agreement.

		<p>YSU also recently concluded an in-depth self-review of copier and print services on campus. This exercise has revealed opportunities for savings through modified print management practices. Recommendations are forthcoming, which may include standardizing printers and supplies, and implementing shared printing in lieu of desktop printers.</p>
Computer hardware	Plan to	<p>While YSU has favorable locally-negotiated contracts in place, YSU will work with the IUC-PG to develop a bid process to identify a single manufacturer with common computer configurations.</p>
Travel services	No	<p>YSU uses a locally-negotiated contract with Concur/Traveline and has standardized University travel by requiring all travel to be processed through this vendor, ensuring optimal pricing and policy compliance.</p>
Outbound Shipping	Yes	<p>YSU uses the state of Ohio contract with UPS, which provides a discount of approximately 40%. In addition, YSU's Delivery Services office utilizes rate comparison software that ensures optimal shipping pricing.</p>
Scientific supplies & equipment	Plan to	<p>Some IUC campuses already have favorable contracts in place, and YSU is working with the IUC-PG to identify opportunities to join these existing agreements, which may result in lower costs through greater volume.</p>
Office supplies & equipment	Yes	<p>YSU uses the IUC-PG price agreements for office supplies.</p>

Assets and Operations

Recommendation 4 | Assets and Operations

4A Asset review: Each institution must conduct an assessment of its noncore assets to determine their market value if sold, leased or otherwise repurposed. Where opportunities exist, colleges and universities must consider coordinating these efforts with other Ohio institutions to reap larger benefits of scale.

Please provide an overview of the process used for the institution's asset review and the key outcomes below or on additional pages:

In concert with the University's Institutional Efficiency Council, YSU performed a self-evaluation of campus assets, identifying campus housing and other student amenities as prime opportunities for sale or lease. In addition, YSU conducted an RFP to solicit proposals for private investment on campus-owned property. This RFP resulted in YSU leasing approximately 5.5 acres of campus property to private student housing developers. These projects will not only create new revenue streams to the University, it allows for the creation of campus amenities—at no cost to YSU—that are in demand among today's college students.

Additionally, YSU is working with the State of Ohio Department of Administrative Services on the potential sale the University-owned Courtyard Apartments, a 408-bed student housing facility. This would reduce the University's debt burden, reduce depreciation costs significantly, and provide an infusion of cash that could be used for other strategic investments, such as endowed scholarships.

4B Operations review: Each institution must conduct an assessment of non-academic operations that might be run more efficiently by a regional cooperative, private operator or other entity. These opportunities must then be evaluated to determine whether collaboration across institutions would increase efficiencies, improve service or otherwise add value.

Please provide an overview of the process used for the institution's operations review and the key outcomes below or on additional pages:

In concert with YSU's institutional efficiency council, YSU's Finance division worked with key campus stakeholders to evaluate campus assets and operations. In addition, YSU participated in a collaborative RFP with Kent and Wright state universities to select KPMG to perform an opportunity scan of campus operations. As a result of these exercises, YSU identified a number of opportunities:

1. **Bookstore:** YSU conducted an RFP to identify a private vendor to operate the University-operated bookstore. Consequently, YSU selected Barnes & Noble College to take over bookstore operations. This is expected to result in significant economies that will reduce YSU expenses while increasing revenue opportunities.
2. **Health Clinic:** Through its affinity partnership with Mercy Health, YSU has entered into an agreement to allow Mercy to manage, operate and expand services at YSU's on-campus health clinic. This will result in direct cost savings, and will ultimately improve campus health and wellness.
3. **Print Management Services:** YSU is evaluating the Ohio State University's agreement with ComDoc, the pricing for which has been made available to other state universities. In addition, YSU is working directly with ComDoc on an in-depth analysis, print audit, and peer review, which could result in a re-negotiated contract between the parties.
4. **IT Help Desk:** YSU is participating in a collaborative RFP, led by Cuyahoga Community College, to select a private vendor to support, augment or otherwise outsource on campus IT help desk operations.
5. **Grounds:** YSU is evaluating opportunities for outsourcing some landscaping functions to private vendors.
6. **Motor Pool:** YSU is evaluating whether a fleet leasing program is more advantageous than YSU's current practice of purchasing vehicles.
7. **Real Estate Management:** The University is collaborating with private developers to lease campus property to expand campus amenities, such as student housing and retail, and to enhance campus aesthetics. YSU is also collaborating with the City of Youngstown to enhance campus gateways, including Wick and Lincoln avenues.

4C Affinity partnerships and sponsorships: Institutions must, on determining assets and operations that are to be retained, evaluate opportunities or affinity relationships and sponsorships that can support students, faculty and staff. Colleges and universities can use these types of partnerships to generate new resources by identifying "win-win" opportunities with private entities that are interested in connecting with students, faculty, staff, alumni or other members of their communities.

Has the institution implemented this recommendation? If yes, please provide an overview of the process used and the key outcomes. Yes, YSU has evaluated and continues to evaluate opportunities for affinity partnerships. This evaluation process focused on local and regional stakeholders having missions that are consistent with and complimentary of YSU's academic and research mission. As part of this process, YSU signed two (2) affinity agreements during FY 2016.

If the institution has not implemented this recommendation, is there a plan to implement? If yes, what is the implementation plan? If the institution has not implemented this recommendation and does not plan to do so, please provide the rationale.

Please identify partnerships and sponsorships in effect for FY2016:

Partnerships/Sponsorships	Description
<p>Mercy Health System</p>	<p>This partnership allows both parties to share physical and intellectual resources, such as classroom and lab space, YSU faculty, student interns, and Mercy nurses and physicians. For instance, Mercy Health assumed management of YSU's on-campus health clinic on May 1, 2016, which provides ready care services to the campus community. This partnership will also facilitate the development of academic programming opportunities, such as YSU's new masters program in athletic training—the first of its kind in the state of Ohio.</p>
<p>PNC Bank</p>	<p>This new partnership provides numerous benefits to YSU, namely in the form of treasury management services to support YSU operations, as well as campus workplace banking for faculty and staff, and student banking services such as financial aid and loan processing. In addition, YSU is leveraging this partnership to augment financial literacy awareness education for students, especially first-year YSU students—at no cost to YSU or to students. This agreement also provides new internship opportunities for students enrolled in YSU's Williamson College of Business Administration.</p>

Administrative

Recommendation 5 | Administrative cost reforms

5A Cost diagnostic: Each institution must produce a diagnostic to identify its cost drivers, along with priority areas that offer the best opportunities for efficiencies. This diagnostic must identify, over at least a 10-year period:

- Key drivers of costs and revenue by administrative function and academic program;
- Distribution of employee costs — both among types of compensation and among units;
- Revenue sources connected to cost increases — whether students are paying for these through tuition and fees, or whether they are externally funded;

- Span of control for managers across the institution — how many employees managers typically oversee, by the manager's function; and
- Priority steps that would reduce overhead while maintaining quality — which recommendations would have the most benefit?

Has the institution produced a cost diagnostic? If yes, please provide an overview of the process used and the key outcomes. No, YSU has not yet produced a cost diagnostic. However, some of the main variables in a cost diagnostic are fairly straightforward, such as employee compensation, the data for which is already reported in YSU's annual budget and audited financial statements.

Please provide details on the result of the assessment. What are the cost drivers, based on the categories above? Please discuss the institution's priority areas that offer the best opportunities for recommendation.

If the institution has not produced a cost diagnostic, is there a plan to? If yes, what is the implementation plan? If the institution has not completed a cost diagnostic and does not plan to do so, please provide the rationale. Yes, YSU intends to produce a cost diagnostic. YSU plans to evaluate best practices for this type of diagnostic tool and plans to collaborate with other Ohio public universities in developing and employing the cost diagnostic.

5B Productivity measure: The Department of Higher Education developed a common measurement of administrative productivity that can be adopted across Ohio's public colleges and universities. While the measure should be consistent, each institution should have latitude to develop its own standards for the proper level of productivity in its units. This will allow, for instance, for appropriate differences between productivity in high-volume environments vs. high-touch ones.

What steps has the institution taken to improve the productivity measure score or what are the institution's plans to improve the score?

- The ODHE has created two productivity measures: (1) Course completion ratio that is calculated by dividing course completed FTE by administrative employee headcount; and (2) degree completion ratio that is calculated by dividing student degree completions by administrative employee headcount. To improve these ratios, YSU has raised admission requirements, invested in additional academic advisors, created a new division of Student Success, and continues to hold the line on filling administrative positions.
- The ODHE has also created two efficiency measures: (1) Administrative headcount ratio that is calculated by dividing all employee headcount by administrative employee headcount; and (2) administrative expenditure ratio that is calculated by dividing E&G expenditures by administrative salary expenditures. To improve these ratios, YSU continues to hold the line on filling administrative position vacancies and has held administrative salaries flat. In addition, YSU implemented a major organizational restructuring during FY 2016 that resulted in reduced administrative salary expenditures.

Has the institution implemented or considered utilizing Lean Six Sigma methodology as a tool to evaluate the institution's processes?

Though this has not been implemented, YSU does employ some of the characteristic of Lean Six Sigma, such as continuous

improvement, teamwork, waste elimination, and innovation and redesign of both academic and administrative practices.

5C Organizational structure: Each institution should, as part or as a consequence of its cost diagnostic, review its organizational structure in line with best practices to identify opportunities to streamline and reduce costs. The institutional reviews also should consider shared business services — among units or between institutions, when appropriate — for fiscal services, human resources and information technology.

Has the institution reviewed its organizational structure? If yes, please provide an overview of the process used and the key outcomes. Yes, review of YSU's organizational structure is an ongoing and continuous process. Changes to YSU's organizational structure are made on the basis of need, priority, and opportunity. For example, at the onset of FY 2016, YSU recognized the need to enhance mission-critical areas, and took advantage of retirement and attrition among some senior administrators to implement a major management re-organization. This exercise changed reporting lines, prioritized the areas of Student Success, Student Experience, and Research, and resulted in a net reduction of 7 FTE positions that reduced payroll and benefit costs by \$1 million.

Additionally, YSU will continue to strategically evaluate certain divisional organizational structures, beginning with the area of Information Technology Services. YSU plans to conduct an independent evaluation (through a third-party engagement) to determine if opportunities exist for enhanced staffing efficiencies within the University's various IT offices. YSU intends to initiate this analysis in FY 2016, with completion and implementation expected in FY 2017.

If the institution has not reviewed the organizational structure, is there a plan to? If yes, what is the implementation plan? If the institution not completed a review and does not plan to do so, please provide the rationale.

5D Health-care costs: Like other employers, colleges and universities have experienced rapid growth in health-care costs. To drive down costs and take advantage of economies of scale, the Department of Higher Education has convened a working group to identify opportunities to collaborate. While no information on healthcare costs is required in this year's survey, please feel free to share ideas that the institution believes may be helpful for the working group to consider.

(Optional) Has the institution identified any healthcare reforms that the working group should consider? Please describe. Yes, a statewide or regional consortium should be pursued to allow state colleges and universities to leverage purchasing power within the marketplace for health care insurance. Additionally, special legislation should be introduced that would remove health care insurance coverage from collective bargaining in the public sector. This would enable employee health care plans to be normalized across various campuses and public employers.

(Optional) Has the institution achieved any expected annual cost savings through health-care efficiencies? Please explain how cost savings were estimated. Yes, through the collective bargaining process, YSU has reduced and stabilized healthcare costs by raising employees' share of premium costs, and through plan design changes.

5E Data centers: Institutions must develop a plan to move their primary or disaster recovery data centers to the State of Ohio Computer Center (SOCC).

Has the institution implemented this recommendation? If yes, please provide an overview of the process used and the key outcomes. No, YSU has not implemented this recommendation.

If the institution has not implemented this recommendation, is there a plan to implement? If yes, what is the implementation plan? If the institution has not implemented this recommendation and does not plan to do so, please provide the rationale. Moving YSU's data centers to the State of Ohio Computer Center would result in an immediate increase in costs to the University, which is counter to the intent of these recommendations. In April 2016, however, YSU entered into a collaborative reciprocal agreement with the University of Akron to house backup data servers and other IT equipment in case an unforeseen event at either campus causes loss of or damage to critical IT infrastructure. In addition, YSU is pursuing a similar agreement with Cleveland State University.

5F Space utilization: Each Ohio institution must study the utilization of its campus and employ a system that encourages optimization of physical spaces.

Has the institution implemented this recommendation? If yes, please provide an overview of the process used and the key outcomes. Yes, YSU is in the process of implementing this recommendation. Through a competitive RFP process, YSU selected a private firm, Stantec, to conduct a space utilization study, focused primarily on classroom and lab utilization.

Please provide details on the results of the assessment below or on additional pages: Detail expected to be available in May or June 2016.

If the institution has not implemented this recommendation, is there a plan to implement? If yes, what is the implementation plan? If the institution has not implemented this recommendation and does not plan to do so, please provide the rationale.

Energy

Energy Efficiencies seek to refine sustainable methods utilized by institutions to procure and use energy (resulting in more efficient use of energy), including, but not limited to lighting systems, heating & cooling systems, electricity, natural gas, and utility monitoring.

What energy efficiency projects has the institution implemented or enhanced within fiscal year 2016?

Project	Collaborative Partnership(s)	Explanation
Phase I Energy Conservation Initiative - completion	N/A	FY 2016 marks the terminal year of a 10-year energy conservation project. In concert with YSU's energy partner, Johnson Controls Inc., YSU has enjoyed significant energy savings, primarily in the area of electricity consumption. This project focused on the replacement of electrical and lighting fixtures, and control mechanisms, resulting in significant utility cost savings and cost avoidance.
Phase II Energy Conservation Initiative - new project	N/A	Again with its energy partner, Johnson Controls, Inc., YSU has begun construction of a steam plant on campus, which will enable YSU to produce its own steam heat. This project will reduce YSU's dependence on outside utility providers, enable YSU to address deferred maintenance in its utility tunnels, and significantly reduce energy costs by \$2 million annually.

Section II: Academic Practices

Recommendation 6 | Textbook Affordability

6A Negotiate cost: Professional negotiators must be assigned to help faculty obtain the best deals for students on textbooks and instructional materials, starting with high-volume, high-cost courses. Faculty must consider both cost and quality in the selection of course materials.

Has the institution implemented this recommendation? If yes, please provide an overview of the process used and the key outcomes. Although professional negotiators have not been assigned, YSU has two initiatives underway that are intended to directly impact textbook affordability:

1. YSU's Maag Library and Student Government Association have partnered to provide free access to textbooks for all general education sections. This program allows students to access textbooks at YSU's library—at no cost—in three-hour increments. In addition, this initiative seeks to increase student awareness of other open-source textbook options available for free in digital format, such as gutenberg.org and open.umn.edu.
2. YSU is in the process of outsourcing campus bookstore operations to Barnes & Noble College (BNC). Because BNC has a larger presence in the national textbook market, textbooks can be acquired—and sold to students—at comparatively lower prices. And BNC's price-match guarantee program will ensure that textbooks at YSU's bookstore will be sold at the lowest possible price. In addition, as part of YSU's negotiated agreement with BNC, a minimum of \$10,000 per year in textbook scholarships will be made available to YSU students.

If the institution has not implemented this recommendation, is there a plan to implement? If yes, what is the implementation plan? If the institution has not implemented this recommendation and does not plan to do so, please provide the rationale. After Barnes & Noble College has fully transitioned to YSU's bookstore operator, the University will evaluate the impact of outsourcing on textbook prices and re-evaluate the merits of assigning professional negotiators in the future.

6B Standardize materials: Institutions must encourage departments to choose common materials, including digital elements, for courses that serve a large enrollment of students.

Has the institution implemented this recommendation? If yes, please provide an overview of the process used and the key outcomes. For multi-section courses, YSU's existing policy requires that all instructors use the same textbook.

If the institution has not implemented this recommendation, is there a plan to implement? If yes, what is the implementation plan? If the institution has not implemented this recommendation and does not plan to do so, please provide the rationale.

6C Develop digital capabilities: Institutions must be part of a consortium to develop digital tools and materials, including open educational resources, that provide students with high-quality, low-cost materials.

Please explain your efforts to develop digital tools and materials.

Some YSU faculty have begun utilizing digital resources, using their own efforts to identify and secure the required materials. If the institution has not implemented this recommendation, is there a plan to implement? If yes, what is the implementation plan? If the institution has not implemented this recommendation and does not plan to do so, please provide the rationale. YSU has not yet introduced a policy in this regard. During the next negotiation cycle with the faculty bargaining unit, YSU will consider implementing an incentive plan for faculty that select digital tools.

Recommendation 7 | Time to Degree

7A Education campaign: Each institution must develop a coordinated campaign to educate its full-time undergraduates about the course loads needed to graduate on time (two years for most associate degrees and four years for most bachelor's degrees).

Has the institution implemented this recommendation? If yes, please provide an overview of the process used and the key outcomes.

YSU had previously produced posters encouraging students to enroll in a minimum of 15 hours per semester. Such materials have now been removed. In its place, advisors have been reminded that students need 15 – 16 hours per semester to graduate within 4 years, and they are encouraged to work with students to achieve the optimal enrollment. YSU's bulk tuition rate was extended to 18 hours, allowing students to register for 17 or 18 credit hours without an increased cost. A key message that YSU advisors are communicating to students is that by taking a heavier course load and by completing a degree program in a shorter time period, students may enjoy significant cost savings during their college career.

If the institution has not implemented this recommendation, is there a plan to implement? If yes, what is the implementation plan? If the institution has not implemented this recommendation and does not plan to do so, please provide the rationale.

7B Graduation incentive: Institutions should consider establishing financial incentives to encourage full-time students to take at least 15 credits per semester.

Has the institution implemented this recommendation? If yes, please provide an overview of the process used and the key outcomes. Beyond the built-in financial incentives that already exist, YSU has not established other incentives at this time.

If the institution has not implemented this recommendation, is there a plan to implement? If yes, what is the implementation plan? If the institution has not implemented this recommendation and does not plan to do so, please provide the rationale. During the summer and fall of 2016, YSU will evaluate whether its tuition/fee ERP system can be modified to accommodate a tuition guarantee program that would enable different tuition rates for different student cohorts. This type of guarantee program could be tied to academic success, creating an incentive for students to matriculate to stay eligible for a lower tuition rate. However, until the capabilities of our ERP system is fully evaluated, YSU cannot commit to this type of incentive program.

7C Standardize credits for degree: Institutions should streamline graduation requirements so that most bachelor's degree programs can be completed within 126 credit hours or less and an associate degree programs can be completed within 65 credit hours or less. Exceptions are allowed for accreditation requirements.

Has the institution implemented this recommendation? If yes, please provide an overview of the process used and the key outcomes. Yes, the YSU academic senate approved changes to minimum graduation requirements, reducing the minimum number of credit hours needed to graduate to 120 hours. The YSU administration has been working with academic departments in an effort to reduce the number of credits required for all programs. Much progress has been made, but some programs remain above the minimum due to accreditation requirements.

If the institution has not implemented this recommendation, is there a plan to implement? If yes, what is the implementation plan? If the institution has not implemented this recommendation and does not plan to do so, please provide the rationale.

7D Data-driven advising: Institutions should enhance academic advising services so that students benefit from both high-impact, personalized consultations and data systems that proactively identify risk factors that hinder student success.

Has the institution implemented this recommendation? If yes, please provide an overview of the process used and the key outcomes. YSU has centralized its career and academic advising office. YSU is currently searching for a director for this office and for required additional staff. In addition, we have developed a career ladder for our advising staff and are currently aligning the staff into that ladder. This type of career ladder ensures that advisors remain up-to-date and knowledgeable of changes in their field, ensuring the best possible advising services for YSU students.

If the institution has not implemented this recommendation, is there a plan to implement? If yes, what is the implementation plan? If the institution has not implemented this recommendation and does not plan to do so, please provide the rationale.

7E Summer programs: Each campus must develop plans to evaluate utilization rates for summer session and consider opportunities to increase productive activity. In particular, institutions should consider adding summer-session options for high-demand classes and bottleneck courses that are required for degree completion.

Please provide details on the results of the assessment. In particular, please address whether the campus added summer session options for high-demand and bottleneck classes.

If the institution has not implemented this recommendation, is there a plan to implement? If yes, what is the implementation plan? If the institution has not implemented this recommendation and does not plan to do so, please provide the rationale. YSU has not done any direct analysis of summer course utilization. This will be a project for the upcoming academic year.

YSU has, however, implemented a summer *Jump Start* program, whereby incoming freshmen students can take up to two 3-credit hour courses for a reduced flat rate of \$500 for one course or \$1,000 for two courses from a select menu of General Education courses.

7F Pathway agreements: Ohio institutions should continue to develop agreements that create seamless pathways for students who begin their educations at community or technical colleges and complete them at universities.

Has the institution implemented this recommendation? If yes, please provide an overview of the process used and the key outcomes. Yes, YSU is collaborating with Eastern Gateway Community College to develop appropriate pathway opportunities.

Please provide details. In particular, how many articulation agreements does the institution have with other Ohio colleges and universities (either 2+2 or 3+1)? YSU has entered into formal agreements in several health profession programs with Lorain and Lakeland community colleges.

If the institution has not implemented this recommendation, is there a plan to implement? If yes, what is the implementation plan? If the institution has not implemented this recommendation and does not plan to do so, please provide the rationale.

7G Competency-based education: Institutions should consider developing or expanding programs that measure student success based on demonstrated competencies instead of through the amount of time students spend studying a subject.

Has the institution implemented this recommendation? If yes, please provide an overview of the process used and the key outcomes. No.

If applicable, please provide additional details. In particular, how many students does the institution estimate the competency-based education programs will serve?

If the institution has not implemented this recommendation, is there a plan to implement? If yes, what is the implementation plan? If the institution has not implemented this recommendation and does not plan to do so, please provide the rationale. YSU had considered participation in a competency based program. However, it appeared that the state of Ohio was working to centralize the process for credit authorization. Consequently, YSU has deferred these efforts, pending the outcome of the state's process.

Recommendation 8 | Course and Program Evaluation

8 Duplicative Programs: Institutions should consider consolidating courses and/or programs that are duplicated at other colleges and universities in their geographic area.

Has the institution implemented this recommendation? If yes, please provide an overview of the process used and the key outcomes.

Yes, YSU has developed a number of partnership programs and consortia designed to cooperate with and leverage the resources among neighboring institutions. For example, YSU shares programs through partnerships with the Cuyahoga County Educational Service Center, Lakeland Community College, and Lorain County Community College (see table below for specific examples).

In YSU's College of Education, a number of programs have been discontinued due to low enrollments attributable in part to program duplication. These programs include: M.S.Ed. in Early Childhood (online), M.S.Ed. in Educational Technology (online), M.S.Ed. in Special Education (non-licensure), Administrative Specialist license (Pupil Services), B.S.Ed. in French Education, B.S.Ed. in Family and Consumer Sciences Education, B.S.Ed. in Life Sciences Education, B.S.Ed. in Physical Sciences Education, and B.S.Ed. in Earth Sciences Education.

In YSU's College of Liberal Arts and Social Sciences, several programs have been discontinued due to low enrollments attributable in part to program duplication. These programs include the Bachelor of Arts in French and the Bachelor of Arts in Social Studies.

What courses/programs are currently being shared with other institutions?

Course /Program	Partnering Institution	Explanation
Bachelor of Science in Allied Health	Partnership programs with Lorain County Community College and Lakeland Community College	
Bachelor of Science in Applied Science in Criminal Justice	Partnership programs with Lorain County Community College and Lakeland Community College	
Bachelor of Social Work	Partnership programs with Lorain County Community College and Lakeland Community College.	
Master of Social Work	Partnership programs with Lorain County Community College and Lakeland Community College	
Shared endorsement program in Adaptive Physical Education	Otterbein University	
Collaborative program leading to endorsement in Visual Impairment (currently being developed)	Consortium being developed	
Master of Public Health	CEOMPH Consortium of Eastern Ohio Master of Public Health—partnership with The University of Akron, Cleveland	

		State University, Northeastern Ohio College of Medicine, and Ohio University	
Master of Fine Arts in Creative Writing		NEOMFA Northeastern Ohio Master of Fine Arts in Creative Writing—partnership with Cleveland State University, Kent State University, and The University of Akron	
Doctor of Education (Educational Leadership Program)		Offered at Cuyahoga County Education Service Center	
Master of Health and Human Services		Lorain County Community College	
Master of Respiratory Care		Lorain County Community College	
	Course/Program	Partnering Institution	Explanation
Bachelor of Science in Allied Health		Partnership programs with Lorain County Community College and Lakeland Community College	
Bachelor of Science in Applied Science in Criminal Justice		Partnership programs with Lorain County Community College and Lakeland Community College	
Bachelor of Social Work		Partnership programs with Lorain County Community College and Lakeland Community College.	
Master of Social Work		Partnership programs with Lorain County Community College and Lakeland Community College	
Shared endorsement program in Adaptive Physical Education		Otterbein University	
Collaborative program leading to endorsement in Visual Impairment (currently being developed)		Consortium being developed	
Master of Public Health		CEOMPH Consortium of Eastern Ohio Master of Public Health—partnership with The University of Akron, Cleveland State University, Northeastern Ohio College of Medicine, and Ohio University	
Master of Fine Arts in Creative Writing		NEOMFA Northeastern Ohio Master of Fine Arts in Creative Writing—partnership with Cleveland State University, Kent State University, and The University of Akron	

	Offered at Cuyahoga County Education Service Center Lorain County Community College Lorain County Community College	
Course/Program	Partnering Institution	Explanation
Doctor of Education (Educational Leadership Program) Master of Health and Human Services Master of Respiratory Care	Partnership programs with Lorain County Community College and Lakeland Community College	
Bachelor of Science in Allied Health Bachelor of Science in Applied Science in Criminal Justice	Partnership programs with Lorain County Community College and Lakeland Community College	
Bachelor of Social Work Master of Social Work	Partnership programs with Lorain County Community College and Lakeland Community College.	
Shared endorsement program in Adaptive Physical Education Collaborative program leading to endorsement in Visual Impairment (currently being developed) Master of Public Health	Partnership programs with Lorain County Community College and Lakeland Community College Otterbein University	
Master of Fine Arts in Creative Writing	Consortium being developed CEOMPH Consortium of Eastern Ohio Master of Public Health—partnership with The University of Akron, Cleveland State University, Northeastern Ohio College of Medicine, and Ohio University NEOMFA Northeastern Ohio Master of Fine Arts in Creative Writing—partnership with Cleveland State University, Kent State University, and The University of Akron	
Doctor of Education (Educational Leadership Program) Master of Health and Human Services Master of Respiratory Care	Offered at Cuyahoga County Education Service Center Lorain County Community College Lorain County Community College	

Institutions already provided a list of low-enrollment courses to ODHE by January 31. NOTE: this benchmark will be added to the 2017 Institution Efficiency Survey.

If the institution has not implemented this recommendation, is there a plan to implement? If yes, what is the implementation plan? If the institution has not implemented this recommendation and does not plan to do so, please provide the rationale.

Many of YSU's most successful implementations of this recommendation have occurred in the Bitonte College of Health & Human Services. The dean of the college believes that the programs with the best possibility of partnering have now been developed. There are areas in which partnering does not make sense. Nursing, for example, is one of the largest programs in the College of Health & Human Services. Nursing programs are also offered at both Kent State and the University of Akron, institutions which also boast large, competitive programs. The size of all three nursing programs and the full accreditation status seems to support the need for all three programs to be maintained. Although YSU is always receptive to future partnership opportunities, there are no plans for program-sharing in the College of Health & Human Services at this time.

Section III: Policy Reforms

Recommendation 10 | Policy Reforms

10A Financial advising: Ohio's colleges and universities should make financial literacy a standard part of students' education.

Has the institution implemented this recommendation? If yes, please provide an overview of the process used and the key outcomes.

YSU has instituted a new first-year experience course that will be recommended for students entering in fall 2016 and required of all students entering in fall 2017. Financial literacy education will be embedded within this course.

If the institution has not implemented this recommendation, is there a plan to implement? If yes, what is the implementation plan? If the institution has not implemented this recommendation and does not plan to do so, please provide the rationale.

10B Obstacles: The state Department of Higher Education and/or state legislature should seek to remove any obstacles in policy, rule or statute that inhibit the efficiencies envisioned in these recommendations.

What legislative obstacles or policy roadblocks, if any, inhibit efficiencies and affordability practices at the institution?

With so much emphasis being placed on affordability, the state should consider funding policies that recognize and reward institutions that provide comparatively more affordable educational opportunities. For example, YSU's in-state tuition is 9% below the national average and 20% below the state of Ohio average. Yet, the state of Ohio does not recognize YSU's affordability in any formalized way, nor does state funding policy incentivize affordability.

The state should also consider legislation that would eliminate barriers to universities' ability to monetize assets. For example, the process universities must follow to lease and/or sell property is highly cumbersome and requires the approval of multiple state agencies, including the Department of Administrative Services, the Ohio Facilities Construction Commission, the Ohio Attorney General's office, and the Governor's Office.

Section IV: Cost Savings, Redeployment of Savings & Tangible Benefits to Students

The following charts allow each institution to report this information. For the first chart, please provide, if applicable, any actual cost savings to the institution for fiscal year 2016 (or expected annual cost savings) for each of the recommendations from the Task Force. (Please note this does NOT include cost avoidance.) Then the institution should indicate "yes" or "no" to the savings being redeployed to lower costs for students in terms of tuition, room and board, and/or student financial aid. If there was no savings or the institutional savings was not redeployed, please indicate "yes" or "no" to the practice providing a tangible benefit to the quality of students' education.

For the second chart, please provide more detail as to how cost savings were deployed, specifically in the following categories: reductions in cost of attendance, student financial aid, student services, investment in efficiency and affordability tools, and student program improvements. Please use the explanation field to provide further detail.

Please use the chart below to capture, if applicable, FY16 cost savings, or expected annual savings, to institutions in actual dollars:

Recommendation	If applicable, provide the actual FY16 cost savings, or expected annual cost savings to the institution <small>*Put NA if no savings</small>	Were the savings redeployed to reduce the cost of college for students? (Yes or No)	Or did the practice provide tangible benefits to the quality of students' education? (Yes or No)
Efficiency Practices			
3A: Campus Contracts	Under review		
3B: Collaborative contracts	Under review		
4A: Asset Review	N/A, future savings expected		
4B: Operations Review	N/A, future savings expected		
4C: Affinity partnerships and sponsorships		Yes	Yes
5A: Cost diagnostic	\$200,000 N/A		
5B: Productivity measure	Under review		
5C: Organizational Structure	\$1,000,000	Yes	Yes
5D: Health-care costs	N/A, health care reforms implemented prior to FY16		
5E: Data Centers	\$6,000	No	Yes
5F: Space utilization	N/A, space study underway during FY16; future efficiencies expected.		

Energy projects	N/A, energy project being implemented now; savings will begin in FY17		
Academic Practices and Policies			
6A: Negotiate cost on textbook affordability	N/A		
6B: Standardize materials	Savings vary and cannot be reasonably estimated.	No, savings for students, not YSU	Yes
6C: Develop digital capabilities	N/A		
7A: Education Campaign	Potential savings averaging \$11,000 per YSU student		
7B: Graduation Incentive	N/A		
7C: Standardize credits for degrees	\$1,348 per student	No, savings for students, not YSU	Yes
7D: Data-driven advising	Savings vary and cannot be reasonably estimated.		
7E: Summer programs	Summer Jump Start program: potential savings of \$1,000 per YSU student	Yes	Yes
7F: Pathway agreements	N/A	No, savings for students, not YSU	Yes
7G: Competency-based education	N/A		
8: Duplicative courses and programs	Savings vary and cannot be reasonably estimated.	Yes	Yes
Low-enrollment programs:	Savings vary and cannot be reasonably estimated.		
10: Financial advising:	Savings vary and cannot be reasonably estimated.		
Total Expected Annual Cost Savings:	Savings vary and cannot be reasonably estimated.		

Please utilize the chart below to show how the total actual cost savings listed above were redeployed to either (1) reduce the cost of college for students or (2) to provide tangible benefits for the quality of students' education:

Category	Amount Invested	Explanation
Reductions to the total cost of attendance (tuition, fees, room and board, books and materials, or related costs — such as technology)	See student financial aid response below.	YSU's financial aid and scholarship packages directly reduce the total cost of attendance for students.
Student financial aid	\$17,509,719	YSU investment, from the University and its Foundation, used for direct student aid and scholarships during FY16.
Student success services, particularly with regard to completion and time to degree	\$3,056,277	YSU investment in the newly created division of Student Success. Amounts include wages and operating costs. These operations focus heavily on student advising and academic counseling.
Investments in tools related to affordability and efficiency	N/A	
Improvements to high-demand/high-value student programs	N/A	
Add other categories as needed		